

**Causation Meeting
Richmond, VA
December 17, 1999**

PM3003572179

Causation Meeting
December 17, 1999
Philip Morris USA
Richmond, VA

ATTENDEES

Richard Carchman
Bruce Davies
Ruth Dempsey (via telephone)
Hans-Juergen Haussmann (via telephone)
Bettie Nelson
George Patskan
Ed Sanders (via telephone)
Rick Solana
Roger Walk

PM3003572180

Causation Meeting
Friday, December 17, 1999
8:00 – 11:00a
OC - A2E2 Conference Room

Focusing on the Science vs. Law or Policy

- Pre-reading Material:
- USG 1964—Chapter 3—Judgments on Causality
 - Carchman's memo *re* Causality
 - Rothman/Greenland 2nd Edition Modern Epidemiology 1998
 - Carchman's Testimony/Web Sites *re* PM and B&W
-
- Opening Statement—Meeting Purpose Solana
 - Historical Perspective—Internal/External Walk, *et al.*
 - Causality Memo Development and Execution Carchman
 - Company Position All
 - Public Company Statements
 - Frank Statement 1954
 - Hatch Statement (Congress)
 - Shareholders
 - Public Media
 - Regulation
 - Litigation
 - Web Sites
 - Where Do We Go from Here, *e.g.*, Further Refinement All
 - Outcome—Relationship to: All
 - Company Position
 - External Research Agenda
 - Product Development
 - Emerging Issues

PM3003572181

DISCUSSIONS

- WSA's responsibility of Philip Morris' Smoking and Health website.
- Need to discuss causation in terms of:
 - ◆ Product change – mechanisms and constituents in smoke
 - ◆ Informing the consumer – using the website to provide information regarding contribution to lung cancer
 - ◆ Legal – individual versus the general population
 - ◆ Public health – statistical view of causation
- Need to define causation. When is it enough to say something causes a particular outcome?
- For each area, can we identify external literature to indicate causation?

OUTCOMES

- Compilation of company materials that provide a historical view of activity related to causation at PM. Identify accepted legal interpretations. (Walk/Nelson)
- Provide a sense of where there is agreement and identify gaps. Where is missing information that can be pursued? (Dempsey/Sanders)